





Inventory of allometric equations for estimating tree biomass

A database for China

UN-REDD PROGRAMME

September 2014 Rome, Italy

> UN-REDD Programme MRV Report 18 2014

The UN-REDD Programme, implemented by FAO, UNDP and UNEP, has two components: (i) assisting developing countries prepare and implement national REDD strategies and mechanisms; (ii) supporting the development of normative solutions and standardized approaches based on sound science for a REDD instrument linked with the UNFCCC. The programme helps empower countries to manage their REDD processes and will facilitate access to financial and technical assistance tailored to the specific needs of the countries.

The application of UNDP, UNEP and FAO rights-based and participatory approaches will also help ensure the rights of indigenous and forest-dwelling people are protected and the active involvement of local communities and relevant stakeholders and institutions in the design and implementation of REDD plans.

The programme is implemented through the UN Joint Programmes modalities, enabling rapid initiation of programme implementation and channeling of funds for REDD efforts, building on the in-country presence of UN agencies as a crucial support structure for countries. The UN-REDD Programme encourage coordinated and collaborative UN support to countries, thus maximizing efficiencies and effectiveness of the organizations' collective input, consistent with the "One UN" approach advocated by UN members.

Contact

Matieu Henry UN-REDD Programme

Food & Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) Email: <u>Matieu.Henry@fao.org</u>

Recommended citation

Cheng, Z., Gamarra, J. G. P., G. J., and Birigazzi, L. Inventory of allometric equations for estimation tree biomass – a database for China. UN-REDD Programme, Rome, Italy.

Disclaimer

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. The views expressed in this information product are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of FAO.

FAO encourages the use, reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product. Except where otherwise indicated, material may be copied, downloaded and printed for private study, research and teaching purposes, or for use in non-commercial products or services, provided that appropriate acknowledgement of FAO as the source and copyright holder is given and that FAO's endorsement of users 'views ,products or services is not implied in any way.

The conclusions given in this information product are considered appropriate at the time of its preparation. They may be modified in the light of further knowledge gained at subsequent stages of the project.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Dr. L. Fehrmann and all associated colleagues of Georg-August-Universität Göttingen and Dr. Forrester of the University of Freiburg, Germany, for providing support to access reference articles and sharing the work. We thank directors Z. Xu and G. Zhang of State Forestry Administration of China for providing valuable resources.

We also thank Matieu Henry for the general supervision of this report.

We acknowledge with thanks all those who availed information and literature during the development of the allometric equation database for China and this report.

Table of Contents

Executive Summaryiii
Forewordv
1. Introduction1
1.1 Biomass assessment and National Forest Inventory of China1
1.2 GlobAllomeTree web platform
1.3 Objective of the report
2. Database development and allometric equations in China
2.1 Data collection and data entry
2.1.1 Data collection
2.1.2 Database structure
2.2 Allometric equations in China
2.2.1 Geographic location
2.2.2 Global ecological zones
2.2.3 Input and output variables
2.2.4 Vegetation components
2.2.5 Species and taxonomy
3. Comparison of allometric equations using field inventory data: an example using R
4. Recommendations11
5. Conclusion
6. References
Appendices
Appendix 1. References collected in the China database14
Appendix 2. R script
Appendix 3. List of species in the database17

Executive Summary

Under the support of the UN-REDD Programme, an inventory of volume and biomass tree allometric equations is being undertaken globally. This report introduces an allometric equation database developed specifically for China that complements the current database for Asian countries. The database was prepared following the tutorial given by Baldasso, Birigazzi *et al.* Equations were compiled according to different categories to provide an overview of the allometric equations available in the literature. A comparison of the equations using field inventory data was given using statistical software R to present the application of the allometric equations in the specific context. This database reflects decades of experience relevant to supporting countries in the Asia-Pacific region in National Forest Monitoring. Several recommendations were given to support forest biomass assessment and to promote knowledge exchange in the region.

In total, 830 allometric equations from 32 scientific articles have been collected and entered into the database. They have been developed at 46 locations in 17 province-level divisions. Heilongjiang is the single province that produced the most equations. It is located in Northeast China where the major forest industry and forest institutions are. According to the FAO global ecological zoning framework, six biome types (including temperate, subtropical and tropical) are involved in the database. Fifty percent of the equations belong to temperate continental forests. Only 3.4% of the equations are volume equations, and the remaining are biomass equations. The most frequently used predictive variable in single-variable models is diameter at breast height, and in two-variable models are diameter at breast height and tree height. Wood density and crown diameter are presented in more complicated models. Biomass equations cover a wide range of vegetation components, but volume equations apply to stem only. In terms of species and taxonomy, in total 98 species are recorded into the database. The most represented species is *Pinus massoniana*, and four out of the five most represented species are coniferous trees.

During the development of the database, several problems have been identified. The biggest issue concerns the quality of the equations and the reference articles. Information on material and methods is crucial but commonly not given in detail in the articles, therefore the accuracy of the equations is unknown. Primary sources of data should be carefully preserved and the accessibility to them should be increased. Publishing raw field data in open data repositories is an example of good practice. The improving remote sensing techniques gives potential to predict biomass from crown diameter, and therefore it is recommended to develop more equations with crown diameter as an input variable.

The allometric equation database for China contributes to the UN-REDD Programme in facilitating access to data for the preparation of forest biomass and carbon stock and stock change assessment for countries in Southeast Asia. The objective of knowledge exchange is promoted as multiple institutions are involved in collecting reference articles for the database, and the result is shared among these institutions. Moving forward requires promoting the usage of the database and increasing the accessibility of research results. With the China database integrated into the open web platform GlobAllomeTree, more stakeholders can benefit from it.

对估算立木生物量的相对生长方程的清查——中国数据库

提要

在 UN-REDD 项目的支持下,对立木材积和生物量的相对生长方程的清查正在全球范围内展开。

本篇报告介绍了专门针对中国开发的相对生长方程数据库,以此作为对亚洲国家现有数据的补充。该数据库依据由 Baldasso, Birigazzi 等编写的教程而准备,并将相对生长方程按照不同类别进行整理和分析,以提供在文献中可得的相对生长方程的概览。利用统计学软件 R,对相对生长方程在具体条件下的应用进行了对比。此数据库体现了多年的相关经验,可为亚太地区的国家进行森林监测提供支持。报告同时提出了若干有助于估算森林生物量和促进该地区知识交流的建议。

该数据库收集并录入了 32 篇科学论文中的共计 830 个相对生长方程,研究范围覆盖了 17 个省级单位的 46 个地点。位于中国东北部、拥有主要森林产业和众多研究机构的黑龙江 省,是收集到最多相对生长方程的单一省份。依据联合国粮农组织(FAO)的全球生态区 划框架的划分,该数据库涵盖了包括温带,亚热带和热带在内共 6 种生态区,数据库中 50% 的相对生长方程属于温带大陆性森林。材积方程仅占总数的 3.4%,其余均为生物量方程。 单变量模型中最常用的预测变量是胸径,双变量模型中最常用的变量组合为胸径和树高, 一些更为复杂的模型还采用到木材密度和树冠直径。数据库中的生物量方程覆盖了多种植 被组分,而材积方程仅适用于树干。在物种和分类学方面,共计 98 个树种被录入库中, 有关马尾松的相对生长方程数量最多。方程数量最多的五种树种中,四种是针叶材。

在开发数据库的过程中遇到了一些问题,最主要的问题有关于方程和引用的文献的质量。 至关重要的研究材料和方法在参考文献中通常未给出足够详细的信息,这在一定程度上影 响了方程的准确性。原始数据和资料应进行妥善保存,并提高其可得性,如在开放数据库 发布原始数据则是一种良好的做法。日益进步的遥感技术为从树冠直径预测生物量提供了 潜在可能,在未来可开发更多以树冠直径为预测变量的相对生长方程。

中国立木相对生长方程数据库将促进 UN-REDD 对东南亚国家进行森林生物量、碳储量和储量变化的估测提供帮助支持。在未来,应推动数据库的使用和研究成果的推广。伴随中国数据库在开放网络平台 GlobAllomeTree 的发布,更多的利益方将会从中受益。

Foreword

The United Nations Collaborative Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (UN-REDD) is a collaboration between FAO, UNDP and UNEP. Within the partnership, FAO supports countries on technical issues related to forestry and the development of cost effective, transparent, robust and reliable National Forest Monitoring Systems (NFMS) to improve the assessment of forest biomass and carbon stocks.

The UN-REDD Programme facilitates data-sharing, knowledge exchange and collaboration at both the global and regional level. Inventories of volume and biomass tree allometric equations are being undertaken in several continents, and country-specific databases of the equations are being developed and published on GlobAllomeTree, a web platform designed to enable access and optimized selection of the equations (Henry, Bombelli *et al.* 2013). Partnerships are established with international forestry institutions and universities to support knowledge exchange and dialogue.

This report introduces an allometric equation database developed specifically for China that complements the current database for Asian countries. Through the better archiving, harmonizing, and sharing data, regional collaboration in Asia can be further promoted.

1. Introduction

1.1 Biomass assessment and National Forest Inventory of China

At regional and national scales, forest inventory data-based biomass models are widely used as a tool for biomass assessment (Zhao and Zhou 2004). Field ground data are collected and entered into database systems and analyzed using a variety of software and tools. Because the quality of biomass estimation and carbon stocks assessment at country level depends critically on the quality of the allometric equations applied to individual trees and the forest inventory data, it is therefore essential to ensure the quality of input data.

In China, a National Forest Inventory system was launched for the first time by the Ministry of Forestry in 1973, and afterwards at an interval of every five years. Since the 6th NFI (1999-2003), the State Forestry Administration (SFA) became the organizer. The objectives are to identify the status of forest resources at national and provincial levels. Up to 2014 eight NFIs have been conducted in China, with the most recent one covering the period from 2008 to 2013. The NFI system has been continuously improving in terms of technology and methodology. Remote sensing, GPS, modelling methods are widely applied to contribute to efficiency and accuracy (FAO 2007). Because the forest inventories do not include detailed forest biomass information directly, biomass expansion factors that convert merchantable timber volume to biomass of noncommercial components are used to calculate all forest biomass (Fang, Chen *et al.* 2001). Since the early 1980s, the method has been widely used at provincial and national level (Yu, Wang *et al.* 2014).

In order to improve national forest biomass assessment and support policy and measures related to REDD+ and climate change, the eighth NFI included biomass and carbon stock monitoring as an important component. According to this latest NFI, total forest area and total stock volume have increased from 195 to 208 million ha, and from 13.7 to 15.1 billion m³, respectively. Total forest biomass and carbon sink have reached 17 billion tons and 8.4 billion tons (SFA 2014). The national forest inventory reports are available on the SFA website: <u>http://www.forestry.gov.cn/</u>.

The Global Forest Resources Assessments (FRA) launched by FAO also provides country specific reports since FRA2005. Country reports of China are available on FAO website: <u>http://www.fao.org/forestry/fra/en/</u>.

1.2 GlobAllomeTree web platform

GlobAllomeTree is a web platform that aims to inventory existing allometric equations. In 2014 the platform contained more than 12,000 equations and has over 1,900 registered users. It provides free access to allometric equations for different species, tree components and biomes.

Before now, allometric equations from China were missing from the GlobAllomeTree platform for a number of reasons. First of all, the global database is still relatively new and is a work in progress. Secondly, existing allometric equations are mainly found in scientific articles, reports from private companies and hard copies in national libraries. The number of published literature that contains biomass models developed in China is limited, and many of them are written in Chinese. Therefore data accessibility is very restricted. Many documents written in Chinese are from forty years ago and are available only in hard copies. Some are badly preserved, if not missing. These factors all add to the difficulty in developing the Chinese database.

1.3 Objective of the report

The objectives of the report include: (a) to provide access to allometric equations developed in China over many years to support forest biomass assessment in Asia, (b) to provide an overview of the allometric equations available, (c) to present the application of the equations in the specific context,

and (d) to provide some recommendations to support forest biomass assessment and promote knowledge exchange in Southeast Asia.

The allometric equation database of China reflects decades of experience that is relevant to supporting countries in the Asia-Pacific region in National Forest Monitoring. These data could be beneficial to all countries in the region.

2. Database development and allometric equations in China

2.1 Data collection and data entry

2.1.1 Data collection

The allometric equations in the database were collected from 32 scientific articles published from 1984 to 2013. Thirteen were written in Chinese with English abstracts. The sources of these articles are listed below:

- a. Internet search through the Google scholar engine;
- b. Provided by Chinese directors from State Forestry Administration and Forestry Carbon Sequestration Accounting and Monitoring Center;
- c. Provided by Faculty of Forest Sciences and Forest Ecology Burckhardt-Institute of Georg-August-Universität Göttingen.

A reference library has been created to keep record of all the reference articles. In total 830 allometric equations have been recorded in the China database. All the equations and relevant metadata were entered according to the instructions given by the "Tutorial for tree allometric equation database development" (Baldasso, Birigazzi *et al.* 2012).

2.1.2 Database structure

The allometric equation database for China was developed following the tutorial. The template used to prepare the database was structured as following:

- a. Location and ecology: Geographical information about the sites where allometric equations are developed.
- b. Global ecological zones: Biome information about the sites. GIS software such as QGIS, Arcview and Arcgis can be used to determine the biome types.
- c. Variables and vegetation components: Information on the input and output variables and units, and the corresponding vegetation components. By following the acronyms provided by the tutorial, data from different sources and times can be better harmonized and integrated into the platform.
- d. Species and taxonomy: Information on the names of the species in the binomial literature in the Latin grammatical form. The names shall contain no accents.
- e. Equation and references: This is the allometric equation and all information about the reference articles.
- f. Regression statistics and contributors: Statistical information on the coefficients of the parameters in the allometric equations. Usually they can be found in the references.

2.2 Allometric equations in China

2.2.1 Geographic location

The allometric equation database for China contains a total of 830 equations for 98 species and 46 locations in 17 province-level divisions (Figure 1). Geographically, these provincial-level divisions cover northeast, northwest, southeast, and southwest China (Table 1).



Figure 1. Number of allometric equations by province-level divisions. No equations are recorded for the following province-level divisions: Beijing, Tianjin, Hebei, Shanxi, Inner Mongolia, Liaoning, Shanghai, Jiangsu, Shandong, Henan, Hainan, Shaanxi, Qinghai, Ningxia, Hong Kong, and Macau.

Table 1. Number of allometric equations by geographical location.

	Region	Number of AE	Provinces
1	Northeast	401	Heilongjiang, Jilin
2	Northwest	31	Gansu, Xinjiang
3	Southeast	324	Anhui, Fujian, Guangdong, Hubei, Hunan, Jiangxi, Zhejiang
4	Southwest	279	Chongqing, Guangxi, Guizhou, Tibet, Sichuan, Yunnan

Most of the study sites are located in southern China, but the province from which the most equations were developed is in northeast China. This is because the major forest industry and forest institutions are in the northeast region, where forests have been repeatedly studied, and therefore the number of allometric equations is the greatest. At the southwest border where the biodiversity is the highest, the number of equations is also large. Southeast China is the most populated area in the country, and northwest has few forests and is understudied. Figure 2 below shows the distribution of China's forests according to the sixth national forest inventory data.



Figure 2. Forest distribution in China based on the sixth National Forest Inventory data (SFA 2005).

2.2.2 Global ecological zones

According to the FAO global ecological zoning framework for 2010 (FAO 2012), the equations collected cover six different biome types, from temperate to tropical systems. Fifty percent of the equations are developed in forests that belong to the temperate system, followed by subtropical system (46%) and tropical system (4%). The single biome that contains the most equations is temperate continental forests (50%). Figure 3 gives the number of equations expressed as a percentage (%).



Figure 3. Number of allometric equations by FAO global ecological zones (FAO 2007; FAO 2012).

2.2.3 Input and output variables

Allometric equations in the database can be categorised into four groups based on the number of input variables in the regression models. Figure 4 is a summary of the four groups in terms of percentage. The following independent variables were observed in the database: diameter at breast height (DBH), diameter at 0 cm (D0), diameter at 10 cm (D10), tree height (H) and length (L) for woody liana, basal area (BA), basal area at 0.1 m (BA0.1), canopy area (CA), wood density (WD), crown length (CL), and volume (V).

The most commonly used predictive variable is DBH, which appears in 583 out of all 830 equations, either untransformed or log-transformed. Other diameter measures such as D0 and D10 are found in 111 equations in addition to DBH. In all the single-variable equations, diameter variables have a dominant proportion of 87.4%. In two-variable models, the most common treatment is a diameter variable (DBH, D0, or D10) and a height variable (H or L). Other combination includes canopy area plus height, and DBH plus wood density. More complicated models that contain three or four variables are found from the same article, and the combinations are uniform. Table 2 is a summary of number of equations compiled by input variables.

In terms of output variables, 28 out of the total 830 equations have volume as the output variable, which account for only 3.4%. The remaining equations are all biomass equations.



Figure 4. Proportion of allometric equations by number of input variables.

Table 2.	Number	of allometri	c equations	by number	of input variables.
----------	--------	--------------	-------------	-----------	---------------------

	Number of equations	Variable names	Percentage
One variable	e variable 500 DBH, D0, D10		87%
		н	5%
		BA, BA0.1	4%
		СА	3%
		V	0%
Two variables	259	DBH+H, D0+H, D10+H	71%
		CA+H	28%
		DBH+WD	1%
Three variables	26	DBH+H+WD	100%
Four variables	45	DBH+H+WD+CL	100%

2.2.4 Vegetation components

The equations recorded into the database cover a wide range of vegetation components (Figure 5); with equations for branches being the most frequent. Volume equations apply to stem only. 'Other' biomass includes woody tissue and shoots.



Figure 5. Number of allometric equations by vegetation component.

2.2.5 Species and taxonomy

In total 98 species are recorded in the database. The five most represented species are *Pinus* massoniana (80 equations), *Abies nephrolepis* (39 equations), *Cunninghamia lanceolata* (38 equations), *Pinus koraiensis* (36 equations), *and Cyclobalanopsis glauca* (36 equations). Except for *Cyclobalanopsis glauca*, these are all coniferous trees. The five most represented genera are *Pinus*, *Guercus, Abies, Castanopsis*, and *Acer*. A complete list of species in the database can be found in Appendix 4.

3. Comparison of allometric equations using field inventory data: an example using R

Field ground data are valuable for a number of reasons. First, they can be applied to new allometric equations to compare their quality. Second, when collecting raw data is not possible, existing data can be a good substitute. Because it is always time consuming and costly to collect new data, it is a good practice to inventory raw data. Multiple stakeholders can benefit from the increasing accessibility of data. Currently there are several open-access data repositories available online, for example Dryad: http://datadryad.org/.

In this part, the data used are taken from published literature; Xiang *et al.* (2011). 197 *P.massoniana* samples were measured with component biomass information recorded in the appendix of the original article. Twelve allometric equations that estimate stem biomass of the same species were selected from the database (Table 3). Eq. 10, 11, and 12, referred to as base models afterwards, were regressed from the raw data in Xiang *et al.* (2011), and the remaining from other literature. Six models use two input variables (DBH and height) and one model uses three (DBH, height and wood density).

ID	Model	n	R2	Reference
1	0.0459*(((DBH [^] 2)*H) [^] 0.8867)	5	0.9821	Ai, X., Shen, Z., <i>et al</i> . (1998)
2	0.0236*(((DBH [^] 2)*H) [^] 0.9955)	10	0.9896	Zhang, Z., Wang, Y., et al. (2006)
3	0.0700*(DBH ² .5460)	10	0.992	Zhang, Z., Wang, Y., et al. (2006)
4	0.036*(DBH [^] 2.609)	10	0.987	Zhang, G., Li, X., <i>et al</i> . (2012)
5	0.015*(((DBH [^] 2)*H) [^] 1.005)	10	0.984	Zhang, G., Li, X., <i>et al</i> . (2012)
6	0.017470*(((DBH [^] 2)*H) [^] 0.998299)	10	0.9956	Xia, X. (2008)
7	0.0590*(DBH [^] 2.2906)	8	0.9746	Zheng, H., Ouyang, Z., <i>et al</i> . (2008)
8	exp(-4.044+1.416*ln(DBH)+1.544*ln(H))	108	NA	Zhang, L., Deng, X., <i>et al</i> . (2012)
9	exp(-9.425+1.391*ln(DBH)+1.467*ln(H)+0.906*ln(WD))	108	NA	Zhang, L., Deng, X., et al. (2012)
10	exp(-2.9928+2.5835*ln(DBH))	197	0.9453	Xiang, W., S. Liu, <i>et al</i> . (2011)
11	exp(-2.9468+2.6207*ln(H))	197	0.8793	Xiang, W., S. Liu, <i>et al</i> . (2011)
12	exp(-3.2145+0.9028*ln((DBH [^] 2)*H))	197	0.9683	Xiang, W., S. Liu, <i>et al</i> . (2011)

Table 3. Stem biomass equations selected to perform the comparison. (n-sample size)

Statistical software R was used to perform the analysis. Stem biomass of the twelve equations were plotted in the graph below (Figure 6). The scatter plots were the raw data from literature. Height data were converted according to the diameter-height relationship

$$\ln(H) = 0.9085 + 0.5944 \times \ln(DBH)$$

which was developed by Zhang *et al.* (2004), and the *P.massoniana* density value of 0.431 gcm⁻³ was taken from Liu *et al.* (2009). The highest estimates were given by Eq. 3 from Zhang *et al.* (2006).



Figure 6. Comparison of stem biomass predicted by 12 equations from the database. Scatter plots are raw data.

In general, the nine stem biomass models (Eq. 1 to 9), are different in the following aspects compared with base models. First of all, the sample sizes are very different. The base models were developed from a sample size of 197 trees, while Eq. 1 to7 were developed from five to ten trees, and Eq. 8 and 9 from 108 trees. Secondly, location varies. The base study involved twenty plots in Southeast China covering nine provinces. The sample sites used to develop Eq. 1 to 7 were also located in southern China, but each equation only involved one plot. Different climate and geographic conditions have thus impacted the growth of the trees. Thirdly, the age of sample trees differs. Last but not least, because of the lack of details in materials and methods of some literature, the precise vegetation component of the stem may differ.

4. Recommendations

China is vast in area and diverse in both biome and vegetation types. The majority of the country is located in temperate and subtropical climate, and the southwest border adjacent to Southeast Asia has a tropical climate. In this area, biome and forest types are similar to northern Laos and Vietnam, and forest research with similar objectives has been done by different institutions. With improved knowledge sharing and exchange practices, multiple stakeholders can benefit from research results.

During the development of the China database several problems were identified. In order to promote the harmonization of existing allometric equations and improve the quality of databases, the following practices are recommended.

Some AEs are taken from secondary sources where primary sources are old and hard-copy, difficult if not impossible to access. As a result, the accuracy of these equations is unknown. Therefore it is always important to preserve primary sources of data, and regularly check the availability. Increasing the accessibility of scientific articles and constantly updating the reference libraries is also recommended.

Information on material and methods is crucial but commonly not given in detail in the articles, especially when they are written in Chinese. Without such information, it is very difficult to determine vegetation components. The regression models also need be clearly specified in the methods; some articles provide regression parameters but do not specify the model. About 15% of the equations in the database give unreliable predictions that are either too big or too small. There may be multiple reasons, including typing errors. Contacting original authors can take an extremely long time and a lot of effort. When there is uncertainty about the equations, the operator is responsible for making a good judgement on the equations. To improve the accuracy of the equations, the material and methods should be as detailed as possible, including the valid range of measurement and regression models used. Local names of species should be recorded in databases if possible. Publishing or submitting raw field data in open data repositories is also recommended.

There is no standardized translation of forestry terminology in Chinese. Consequently when searching for scientific articles using keywords in Chinese, it takes more time and effort. It is therefore a good initiative to standardize terminology in multiple languages. The International Union of Forest Research Organizations (IUFRO) has a SilvaVoc terminology project that aims to inventory forest terminology in multiple languages, but the current database does not contain Chinese or Southeast Asian languages. Information regarding the project can be found at IUFRO's website: http://www.iufro.org/science/special/silvavoc/silvaterm/

Wood density is incorporated in some equations as an input variable. Also there is potential of developing allometric models that use crown diameter to predict biomass. The improving remote sensing techniques may greatly increase the efficiency in forest monitoring and measurement (Holmgren, Masakha *et al.* 1994). Thus it is recommended to develop more equations with crown diameter as an input variable.

5. Conclusion

The allometric equation database for China contributes to the UN-REDD Programme in facilitating access to data for the preparation of forest biomass and carbon stock and stock change assessment for countries in Southeast Asia. Currently the database contains a relatively small number of equations, and therefore requires continuous collating and harmonizing of existing data spread across the literature. However, because the majority of collected articles are published after the year 2000, there is a need to increase the accessibility of earlier articles. The objective of knowledge exchange is promoted when multiple institutions are involved in collecting reference articles for the database, and the result is shared among these institutions.

According to the results from the compilation of data, forests in northwest China and in the tropical region are understudied. Wood density is presented as an input variable in some equations and appears to be a promising variable to include in future research, as it has been proven that wood density is the second most important predictor of aboveground biomass in tropical forests (Chave, Andalo *et al.* 2005).

During the development of the database, the biggest issue is the quality of the allometric equations. Typing errors are often observed, and when the regression parameters contain errors, they give unrealistic predictions. Substantial effort is required to verify the equations and control the quality. These problems are rather general and not specific to any country, and therefore special attention needs to be drawn for similar activities in the future.

Moving forward requires promoting the usage of the database and increasing the accessibility of research results. The UN-REDD Programme is establishing partnerships across the globe. With the China database integrated into the open web platform GlobAllomeTree, more stakeholders can benefit from it.

Baldasso, M., L. Birigazzi, *et al.* (2012). Tutorial for Tree Allometric Equation Database Development. Rome, Italy: 27.

Chave, J., C. Andalo, *et al.* (2005). "Tree allometry and improved estimation of carbon stocks and balance in tropical forests." <u>Oecologia</u> **145**(2005): 87-99.

Fang, J., A. Chen, et al. (2001). "Changes in Forest Biomass Carbon Storage in China Between 1949 and 1998." <u>Science</u> **292**(5525): 2320-2322.

FAO (2007). Brief on national forest inventory NFI China. Rome, Italy, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Forestry Department 15.

FAO (2012). Global Ecological Zones for FAO forest reporting: 2010 update. Rome, Italy, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations: 15.

Henry, M., A. Bombelli, *et al.* (2013). "GlobAllomeTree: International platform for tree allometric equations to support volume, biomass and carbon assessment." <u>iForest - Biogeosciences and Forestry</u> **e1-e5**.

Holmgren, P., J. Masakha, *et al.* (1994). "Not all African land is being degraded: a recent survey of trees on farms in Kenya reveals rapidly increasing forest resources." <u>Ambio</u> **23**(7): 390-395.

Liu, Q., G. Jin, *et al.* (2009). "Provenance variation in growth, stem-form and wood density of Masson Pine at 24-year-old and the provenance division." <u>Scientia Silvae Sincae</u> **45**(10): 55-61.

SFA (2005). China Forest Resources. Beijing, China, State Forestry Administration of China.

SFA (2014). China Forest Resources. Beijing, China, State Forestry Administration of China.

Xiang, W., S. Liu, *et al.* (2011). "General allometric equations and biomass allocation of Pinus massoniana trees on a regional scale in southern China." <u>Ecological Research</u> **26**(4): 697-711.

Yu, D., X. Wang, *et al.* (2014). "Estimates of Forest Biomass Carbon Storage in Liaoning Province of Northeast China: A Review and Assessment." <u>PLoS ONE</u> **9**(2): e89572.

Zhang, L., H. Bi, *et al.* (2004). "Modeling spatial variation in tree diameter-height relationships." <u>Forest Ecology and Management</u> **189**(1–3): 317-329.

Zhang, Z., Y. Wang, *et al.* (2006). "Study on the biomass structure and distribution of natural secondary forest of Pinus assoniana." <u>J Hebei Agri Univ</u> **29**(5): 37-43.

Zhao and Zhou (2004). " Forest Inventory Data (FID) –based biomass models and their prospects."

www.forestry.gov.cn

www.iufro.org

http://www.un-redd.org/Home/tabid/565/Default.aspx

Appendices

Appendix 1. References collected in the China database

Ai, X., Z. Shen, *et al.* (1998). "Studies on biomass and density effect on the Pinus massoniana lamb." Hubei For Sci Techn **105**: 16-18.

Cai, S., X. Kang, *et al.* (2013). "Allometric models for aboveground biomass of ten species in northeast China." Annals of Forest Research **56**(1): 105-122.

Chen, G., Z. Yang, *et al.* (2013). "Carbon storage in achronosequence of Chinese firplantations insouthern China." Forest Ecology and Management **300**(2013): 68-76.

Chen, H. (1998). "Biomass and nutrient distribution in a Chinese-fir plantation chronosequence in Southwest Hunan, China." Forest Ecology and Management **105**(1–3): 209-216.

Feng, Z., Z. Zheng, *et al.* (1998). "Biomass and its allocation of a tropical wet seasonal rain forest in Xishuangbanna." Acta Phytoecologica Sinica **22**(6): 481-488.

Gries, D., A. Foetzki, *et al.* (2005). "Production of Perennial Vegetation in an Oasis-desert Transition Zone in NW China - Allometric Estimation, and Assessment of Flooding and Use Effects." Plant Ecology **181**(1): 23-43.

He, Y., L. Qin, *et al.* (2013). "Carbon storage capacity of monoculture and mixed-species plantations in subtropical China." Forest Ecology and Management **295**(2013): 193-198.

Jiang, H. (1986). "A study on the biomass and production of Picea Purpurea forest communities." Acta Phytoecologica Et Geobotanica Sinica **10**(2): 146-152.

Lai, J., B. Yang, *et al.* (2013). "The Allometry of Coarse Root Biomass: Log-Transformed Linear Regression or Nonlinear Regression?" PLoS ONE **8**(10): e77007.

Li, X., Q. Guo, *et al.* (2010). "Allometry of Understory Tree Species in a Natural Secondary Forest in Northeast China." Scientia Silvae Sincae **48**(8): 22-32.

Liu, X., S. Liu, *et al.* (2006). "Aboveground Biomass of Quercus aquifolioides Shrub Community and Its Responses to Altitudinal Gradients in Balangshan Mountain, Shichuan Province." Scientia Silvae Sinicae **42**(2): 1-7.

Luo, T., W. Li, *et al.* (1999). "A comparative study on biolog ical production of major vegetation types on the Tibetan Plateau." Acta Ecologica Sinica **19**(6): 823-831.

Luo, T., P. Shi, *et al.* (2002). "Distribution patterns of aboveground biomass in Tibetan Alpine vegetation transects." Acta Phytoecologica Sinica **26**(6): 668-676.

Lv, X., J. Tang, *et al.* (2008). "Density and aboveground biomass of lianas in the tropical seasonal rain forests of Xishuangbanna, SW China." Revista de Biologia Tropical **57**(1-2): 211-222.

Lv, X., J. Tang, *et al.* (2007). "Biomass and its allocation in tropical seasonal rainforest in Xishuangbanna, Southwest China." Journal of Plant Ecology **31**(1): 11-22.

Qiu, X., S. Xie, *et al.* (1984). "A preliminary study on biomass of Lithocarpus Xylocarpus forest in Xujiaba region, Ailao Mts., Yunnan." Acta Botanica Yunnanica **6**(1): 85-92.

Ren, H., H. Chen, *et al.* (2010). "Biomass accumulation and carbon storage of four different aged Sonneratia apetala plantations in Southern China." Plant and Soil **327**(1-2): 279-291.

Wang, C. (2006). "Biomass allometric equations for 10 co-occurring tree species in Chinese temperate forests." Forest Ecology and Management **222**(1–3): 9-16.

Wang, J., K. Che, *et al.* (1998). "Study on biomass of water conservation forest on north slope of Qilian Mountains." Journal of Fujian College of Forestry **18**(4): 319-323.

Wang, J., C. Zhang, *et al.* (2011). "Biomass Structure and Allometry of Abies nephrolepis (Maxim) in Northeast China." Silva Fennica **45**: 211-226.

Wang, Q., S. Wang, *et al.* (2013). "Ecosystem carbon storage and soil organic carbon stability in pure and mixed stands of Cunninghamia lanceolata and Michelia macclurei." Plant Soil **370**(2013): 295-304.

Wang, X., C. Wang, *et al.* (2010). "Heartwood and sapwood allometry of seven Chinese temperate tree species." Annals of Forest Science **67**(4): 410-410.

Xia, X. (2008). "Biomass and carbon storage in old-growth Pinus massoniana Lamb. plantation ecosystem." M.S. thesis of Fujian Agriculture and Forestry University **Fuzhou, Fujian, China**.

Xiang, W., S. Liu, *et al.* (2011). "General allometric equations and biomass allocation of Pinus massoniana trees on a regional scale in southern China." Ecological Research **26**(4): 697-711.

Zeng, H.-Q., Q.-J. Liu, *et al.* (2010). "Biomass equations for four shrub species in subtropical China." Journal of Forest Research **15**(2): 83-90.

Zhang, G., X. Li, *et al.* (2012). "Biomass characteristics of dominent tree species (group) at Lingnan forest farm in Anhui Province." Scientia Silvae Sincae **48**(5): 136-140.

Zhang, J., Y. Ge, *et al.* (2007). "Carbon storage by ecological service forests in Zhejiang Province, subtropical China." Forest Ecology and Management **245**(2007): 64-75.

Zhang, K., X. Xu, *et al.* (2010). "Biomass, and carbon and nitrogen pools in a subtropical evergreen broad-leaved forest in eastern China." Journal of Forest Research **15**(4): 274-282.

Zhang, L., X. Deng, *et al.* (2012). "Determining stem biomass of Pinus massoniana L. through variations in basic density." Forestry **85**(2012): 601-609.

Zhang, Z., Y. Wang, *et al.* (2006). "Study on the biomass structure and distribution of natural secondary forest of Pinus assoniana." J Hebei Agri Univ **29**(5): 37-43.

Zheng, H., Z. Ouyang, *et al.* (2008). "Variation of carbon storage by different reforestation types in the hilly red soil region of southern China." Forest Ecology and Management **255**(2008): 1113-1121.

Zheng, Z., Z. Feng, *et al.* (2000). "Biomass and net primary production of primary tropical wet seasonal rainforest in Xishuangbanna." Acta Phytoecologica Sinica **24**(2): 197-203.

Appendix 2. R script

This script will read equations in excel spreadsheets and plot them in one graph. Currently it works only on simple database with single-variable equations that have given maximum and minimum values of the predictive variable.

```
#Read equations in excel and use them in a plot example
eqfile <- read.csv("C:/Users/chengz/Desktop/example.csv", stringsAsFactors = FALSE)
eqfile<-subset(eqfile,X=="DBH" & Z=="None")</pre>
#Draw equations with ranges
#Determine overall x range for the plot
#xseq[which(eqfile$Max_X=="None")]<-seq(0,50,0.1)
eqfile$Equation<-gsub("X","x", eqfile$Equation)
eqfile$Equation<-gsub("log","logb", eqfile$Equation)</pre>
##if ("None" %in% eqfile$Max_X) {
# xseq<-seq(0,10,0.1)</pre>
#Evaluate all equations to determine the range of y's for the plot
#evaleq<-function(xseq)
# try(eval(parse(text=xseq)),silent=FALSE)</pre>
ylimmax<-2000
#Labels in plot
xlab<-paste(eqfile$x[1], " (",eqfile$Unit_x[1],")")
ylab<-paste(eqfile$Output[1], " (",eqfile$Unit_Y[1],")")</pre>
#Rename variables and operators so the system can evaluate them
#curveqs<-eqfile$Equation</pre>
#Create empty plot
#plot(1, type="n", xlab=xlab, ylab=ylab, xlim=c(0, max(eqfile$Max_X)), ylim=c(0, yl
immax))
plot(1, type="n", xlab=xlab, ylab=ylab, xlim=c(0, xlimmax), ylim=c(0, ylimmax))
#Initialize vectors with colors and line widths for different components
colCompon=rainbow(dim(eqfile)[1])
lwdComp<-rep(1,dim(eqfile)[1])</pre>
#Draw curves
for (i in 1:dim(eqfile)[1]){
    #define range for each component
    if ("None" %in% eqfile$Max_X[i]) {
     xrang < -seq(0, 1, 0.1)
   }
     else {
xrang<-seq(as.numeric(eqfile$Min_X[i]),as.numeric(eqfile$Max_X[i]),0.1)#draw ti
cks every 0.1 units of X until the maximum X in the file</pre>
   #define line width for each component
if(eqfile$veg_Component[i]=="above ground biomass") {
    lwdComp[i]=2}
   else if (eqfile$veg_Component[i]=="total biomass"){
    lwdComp[i]=3}
  lines(x,eval(parse(text=eqfile$Equation[i])),lwd=lwdComp[i],col=colCompon[i])
#Draw legend
```

```
legend(0, ylimmax, eqfile$veg_Component[1:dim(eqfile)[1]], cex=0.8, col=colCompon,
lwd=lwdComp, title="Tree components")
```

Appendix 3. List of species in the database

Species	No of equations	Species	No. of equations
Pinus massoniana	80	Lonicera maackii	10
Abies nephrolepis	39	Spiraea ussuriensis	10
Cunninghamia lanceolata	38	Viburnum burejaeticum	10
Pinus koraiensis	36	Elaeocarpus varunua	10
Cyclobalanopsis glauca	36	Semecarpus reticulata	10
Fraxinus mandshurica	35	Cleidion brevipetiolatum	10
Pometia tomentosa	35	Lithocarpus leucostachyus	10
Gironniera subaequalis	33	Litsea rangi	10
Castanopsis eyrei	30	Pterospermum lanceaefolium	10
Quercus aquifolioides	30	Pittosporopsis kerrii	10
Terminalia myriocarpa	25	Goniothalamus griffithii	10
Barringtonia macrostachya	25	Populus euphratica	9
Chisocheton siamensis	25	Betula costata	9
Mezzettiopsis creaghii	25	Pinus elliottii	9
Millettia laptobotrya	25	Camellia oleifera	9
Larix gmelinii	24	Castanopsis sclerophylla	8
Quercus mongolica	24	Liquidambar formosana	8
Betula platyphylla	24	Picea brachytyla	8
Phellodendron amurense	24	Abies fabri	8
Jualans mandshurica	24	Mitrephora wanaii	8
Tilia amurensis	24	Knema cinerea	8
Populus davidiana	23	Lasiococca comberi	8
Acer mono	23	Baccaurea ramiflora	8
Garuaa floribunda	23	Sonneratia apetala	7
Mvristica vunnanensis	23	Uimus davidiana	7
Philadelphus schrenkii	21	Larix olaensis	7
Acer ainnala	20	Pinus densata	6
Padus asiatica	20	Picea crassifolia	6
Euonymus verrucosoides	20	Sabina przewalskii	6
Corvlus mandshurica	20	Machilus viridis	5
Deutzia parviflora	20	Lithocarpus xvlocarpus	5
Rhamnus davuricus	19	Castanopsis wattii	5
Sorbaria sorbifolia	19	Abies salauensis	5
Svrinaa reticulata	18	Schima noronhae	5
Fuonymus alatus	18	Manalietia insianis	5
Rhamnus voshinoi	18	Picea purpurea	5
Viburnum saraentii	18	Castanopsis hystrix	5
Schima superba	17	Michelia macclurei	5
Loropetalum chinense	16	Calliaonum caputmedusae	4
Ouercus fabri	16	Tamarix ramosissima	4
Vitex negundo	10	Picea likianaensis	3
Gardenia jasminoides	10	Alhaai sparsifolia	2
Acanthonanay senticosus	10	Ryttneria arandifolia	2
Reilschmeidig brachythyrsg	10	Struchnos nitida	2
Garcinia cowa	15	Strychnos wallichiana	2
Drynetes indica	15	Strychnos cathavensis	1
Lithocarnus alaber	1.1	Tetrastiama nlanicaulum	1
Cinnamomum camphora	14	Combratum vunnanansis	1
Dicea koraiensis	11	Rousiaonia mekongonsis	1
Not specified	11		1
Not specified	20		